arXiv:1006.3161v3 [gr-qc] 1 Apr 2011

Equivalence of Variations of Statistical and Wald's Entropies

Merav Hadad[1,2] and Judy Kupferman[1]
[1]Department of Physics, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev, Beer Sheva 84105 Israel
[2] Department of Natural Sciences, The Open University of Israel, P.O.B. 808, Raanana 43107, Israel

(Dated: April 4, 2011)

We calculate the variation of the statistical entropy of a black hole with a bifurcate Killing horizon in generalized theories of gravity due to variation of the metric and identification of the energy momentum tensor. Using the classical generalized gravity equations, we find that this exactly equals the variation of Wald's entropy. Since this is proved for any generalized theory of gravity, it indicates that the two entropies have a natural connection and that they may have the same physical origin.

PACS numbers: 73.23.-b, 73.23.Hk, 73.63.Kv

Wald[1,2] has studied black holes in generalized theories of gravity and proposed that the correct dynamical entropy of stationary black hole solutions with bifurcate Killing horizons is a Noether charge entropy. The microphysical understanding of Wald's entropy is unknown. Another approach to the calculation of black hole entropy is that of statistical mechanics[3,4]. Statistical entropy is calculated using the partition function of the fields outside the horizon and thus its microphysical origin is understood. However, since statistical entropy is known to diverge and to depend on the number of fields in the theory, whereas Wald's entropy does not, it seems that the two entropies may come from a different source. Our motivation was to relate the two entropies by calculating the statistical entropy for generalized theories of gravity using the gravitational field equations. A connection between the two entropies would lend weight to the possibility that Wald's entropy too derives from the statistical mechanics of fields in the presence of a black hole.

It has been shown[5] that Wald's entropy is related to the energy momentum tensor. We would like to relate statistical entropy to T_{ab} as well in order to establish a connection between the two different entropies. However the relationship between Wald's entropy and T_{ab} was shown only for the variation of Wald's entropy. We will therefore obtain a similar relationship for the variation of statistical entropy and T_{ab} and thus show equivalence between the variation of the two different entropies.

This paper is organized as follows: First we write the statistical entropy for general theories of gravity in terms of the partition function of the fields outside the horizon. We then calculate the variation of statistical entropy and find a simple relation to the variation of the expectation value of the matter field action $\delta\langle I_m\rangle$. Using the variation of the metric, we express $\delta\langle I_m\rangle$ as a function of the classical energy momentum tensor $\langle T_{ab}\rangle$. With the classical gravitational equations we relate $\langle T_{ab}\rangle$ to the variation of Wald's entropy, and find that the variations of statistical and Wald's entropies are equal. In this way we show a direct functional relationship between the variations of the two entropies. This proof holds for any generalized theory of gravity.

We begin by writing the statistical entropy of the matter fields outside the horizon of a stationary black hole with a bifurcate Killing horizon in generalized theories of gravity. Statistical entropy is given by $S_{st} = -\int \rho \ln \rho D\phi$ where ρ is the probability distribution of the fields outside the horizon and depends on the partition function. The integration is over all the states of the matter fields denoted collectively as ϕ. To identify the partition function of the matter fields we use the matter field action $I_m = \int_V \varepsilon \mathscr{L}_m$ where $\mathscr{L}_m$ is the matter Lagrangian density, V denotes the space-time outside the black hole horizon and ε is a D dimensional space-time volume form. Thus the partition function and the probability distribution of the matter fields are

$$Z = \int \exp(iI_m) D\phi \tag{1}$$

$$\rho = Z^{-1}\exp(iI_m) \tag{2}$$

.

Now that we have defined the partition function and the probability distribution we can calculate the entropy:

$$S_{st} = -\int \rho \ln \rho D\phi. \tag{3}$$

Using eqs. (1,2,3) we find

$$S_{st} = -i\langle I_m\rangle + \ln Z \tag{4}$$

where $\langle I_m\rangle \equiv \int \rho I_m D\phi$. It may seem strange that the entropy has an imaginary component but when we go over to Euclidean time this will become real.

Since it has been shown[5] that the variation of Wald's entropy is related to the energy momentum tensor, we would like to relate the variation of the statistical entropy to T_{ab} as well. To do so, we look at the variation of the statistical entropy δS. From eq. (4) the variation of the entropy becomes

$$\delta S_{st} = -i\delta\langle I_m\rangle + \delta \ln Z. \tag{5}$$

Since

$$\delta \ln Z = iZ^{-1}\int \exp(iI_m)\delta I_m D\phi = i\int \rho\delta I_m D\phi = i\left\langle \delta I_m\right\rangle \tag{6}$$

and since we assume that quantum fluctuations are random so that $\langle \delta I_m\rangle = 0$, we have

$$\delta \ln Z = 0, \tag{7}$$

and so

$$\delta S_{st} = -i\delta\left\langle I_m\right\rangle. \tag{8}$$

We see that there is a simple relationship between the variation of statistical entropy and that of the expectation value for the action $\langle I_m\rangle$.

The next step is to evaluate $\delta\left\langle I_m\right\rangle$ caused by the variation of the matter Lagrangian. We note that this does not affect the black hole geometry. Since $I_m = \int \varepsilon\mathcal{L}_m$ where ε is a D- dimensional volume form, independent of the matter fields,

$$\begin{aligned}\delta\left\langle I_m\right\rangle &= \delta\int \varepsilon\left\langle \mathcal{L}_m\right\rangle \\ &= \int \frac{\delta(\varepsilon\left\langle \mathcal{L}_m\right\rangle)}{\delta g^{ab}}\delta g^{ab} \\ &= \int \frac{\varepsilon}{2}\left\langle T_{ab}\right\rangle \delta g^{ab}\end{aligned} \tag{9}$$

where $\left\langle T_{ab}\right\rangle = \frac{2}{\varepsilon}\frac{\delta(\varepsilon<\mathscr{L}_m>)}{\delta g_{ab}}$ and $\left\langle T_{ab}\right\rangle \equiv \int \rho T_{ab} D\phi$ is actually the classical energy momentum tensor, and $\left\langle \mathcal{L}_m\right\rangle = \int \rho\mathcal{L}_m d\phi$. Since we want to relate the statistical entropy to Wald's entropy it will be useful if we follw Wald and Iyer[2] and express the variation of the metric in terms of a vector $\tilde{\chi}_a$: $\delta g_{ab} = \nabla_a\tilde{\chi}_b + \nabla_b\tilde{\chi}_a$

$$\begin{aligned}\delta S_{st} &= -i\int\limits_V \frac{\varepsilon}{2}\left\langle T_{ab}\right\rangle\left[\nabla^a\tilde{\chi}^b + \nabla^b\tilde{\chi}^a\right] \\ &= -i\int\limits_V \varepsilon\left\langle T_{ab}\right\rangle\nabla^a\tilde{\chi}^b \\ &= -i\int\limits_V \varepsilon\nabla^a\left\langle T_{ab}\right\rangle\tilde{\chi}^b + i\int\limits_V \varepsilon\nabla^a\left[\left\langle T_{ab}\right\rangle\tilde{\chi}^b\right]\end{aligned} \tag{10}$$

where we have used symmetry of T_{ab} and integration by parts. Since $\nabla^a\left\langle T_{ab}\right\rangle = 0$ we obtain

$$\delta S_{st} = i\int\limits_V \varepsilon\nabla^a\left[\left\langle T_{ab}\right\rangle\tilde{\chi}^b\right] \tag{11}$$

From the generalized Stokes Law we have $\int_V (\nabla^c\omega_c)\,\varepsilon = \int_H \omega^c\varepsilon_c$ and using $\omega_c = \left\langle T_{ab}\right\rangle\tilde{\chi}^b$ we have

$$\delta S_{st} = i\int\limits_H \left\langle T_{ab}\right\rangle\tilde{\chi}^a\varepsilon^b \tag{12}$$

where ε^b is a (D-1) volume form and H denotes the boundary of V.

To find a connection between statistical and Wald's entropies we now look at the variation of Wald's entropy. In[5] it was found that

$$\delta_t S_W = T\int T^{\textbf{class}}_{ab}\tilde{\chi}^a\tilde{\chi}^b\Sigma = T\int T^{\textbf{class}}_{ab}\tilde{\chi}^a\varepsilon^b, \tag{13}$$

where $\delta_t = \chi_a\nabla^a$ signifies a variation along the timelike vector χ_a, $S_W = -2\pi\oint_H \frac{\partial\mathcal{L}}{\partial R_{abcd}}\hat{\varepsilon}_{ab}\varepsilon_{cd}$ is Wald's entropy, T is the black hole temperature, $T^{\textbf{class}}_{ab}$ is the classical energy momentum tensor and $\tilde{\chi}^b\Sigma = \varepsilon^b$.[7]

We now relate this result to the variation of statistical entropy, eq.(12) above. There are several discrepancies: the form of the variation itself, the temperature and the energy momentum tensor. The classical energy momentum tensor is equal to the quantum expectation value: $T^{ab}_{\textbf{class}} = \left\langle T_{ab}\right\rangle$. The variation of Wald's entropy $\delta_t S$ is a time derivative, whereas for the statistical entropy we have varied the metric by a timelike vector χ^a, so that in fact $\delta S = S(t+\Delta t) - S(t) = \Delta t\cdot\delta_t S$. Since we are dealing with thermodynamic quantities we go to Euclidean space and require that $\Delta t = i\beta$ and thus:

$$\delta S_W = i\beta\delta_t S_W. \tag{14}$$

Finally, using eqs. (12),(13),(14), $\beta = T^{-1}$ and $T^{ab}_{\textbf{class}} = \left\langle T_{ab}\right\rangle$ we find that

$$\delta S_W = \delta S_{ST}. \tag{15}$$

The variation of statistical entropy and Wald's entropy are thus seen to be equal. A detailed example appears in the appendix.

We would like to see if this equivalence applies to the entropies themselves. However this is problematic. We can plug the action into the expression for the statistical entropy in eq. (4) but we then need to express I_m as a function of T_{ab}. We have done so here by varying the metric, but without the variation this is a problem, and it will be necessary in future work to see if there is a way to do so, or to find another method of comparing the two entropies.

In conclusion, we have shown that the variation of the statistical entropy of the matter fields caused by variation of the matter Lagrangian density is equal to the variation of Wald's entropy. This is true for any generalized theory of gravity. This indicates that the two entropies may have a natural connection, and that they may reflect the same physical phenomenon.

Acknowledgments: We thank Ramy Brustein, Dan Gorbonos and Joey Medved for helpful comments. This research was supported by the Israel Science Foundation grant no 470/06 and by the Open University of Israel's Research Fund.

Appendix A: Example

As an example we illustrate our proof for a simple general theory. We take the Einstein-Hilbert action with an additional term λR^2 and a massless scalar field:

$$L_G = \frac{1}{16\pi G} R + \lambda R^2, \tag{A.1}$$

$$L_m = \frac{1}{2}\nabla_a\phi\nabla^a\phi. \tag{A.2}$$

The classical gravity equation becomes[6]:

$$\langle T_{ab}\rangle = \frac{1}{8\pi G} R_{ab} + 4\lambda\left(RR_{ab} - \nabla_a\nabla_b R + g_{ab}\nabla^2 R\right) - g_{ab}L_G \tag{A.3}$$

where $\langle T_{ab}\rangle = \int \rho T_{ab} D\phi$, ρ is the probability distribution defined in eq. (2) and

$$T_{ab} = \nabla_a\phi\nabla_b\phi - \frac{1}{2} g_{ab}\nabla_c\phi\nabla^c\phi. \tag{A.4}$$

Though $\langle T_{ab}\rangle$ is known to diverge[?] , we assume that with a proper (yet unknown) re-normalization technique , $\langle T_{ab}\rangle$ will become the classical stress-energy tensor.

In order to evaluate the variation of the black hole‘s statistical entropy, we need to be able to calculate the quantity $\delta\int_H \langle T_{ab}\rangle \chi^a\epsilon^b = \int_H \left(\int \delta\rho T_{ab} D\phi\right)\chi^a\epsilon^b$. This can be done by using the classical gravity equation (eq. (A.3)):

$$\begin{aligned} &\delta \int_H \langle T_{ab}\rangle \chi^a\epsilon^b \\ &= \delta\int_H \left(\frac{1}{8\pi G} R_{ab} + 4\lambda\left(RR_{ab} - \nabla_a\nabla_b R\right)\right)\chi^a\epsilon^b \end{aligned} \tag{A.5}$$

where we used $\chi^a\epsilon_a = 0$ (because $\epsilon_a = \tilde{\chi}^a\Sigma$ and χ^a is null). Since for any binormal ϵ_{ab}: $R_{abcd}\chi^d = -\kappa R_{abcd}\tilde{\chi}^d = -\kappa\nabla^c\hat{\epsilon}_{ab}$ we find $R_{bd}\chi^d = -\kappa\nabla^a\hat{\epsilon}_{ab}$ and thus

$$\begin{aligned} &\delta\int \langle T_{ab}\rangle \chi^a\epsilon^b \\ &= -\kappa\delta\int \nabla^a\left(\frac{1}{8\pi G}\hat{\epsilon}_{ab} + 4\lambda R\hat{\epsilon}_{ab}\right)\epsilon^b. \end{aligned} \tag{A.6}$$

Using $d\left(W^{cd}\epsilon_{cd}\right) = 2\nabla_c W^{cd}\epsilon_d$ (ϵ_{cd} is a D-2 volume form) we find

$$\begin{aligned} \delta\int \langle T_{ab}\rangle \chi^a\epsilon^b &= -\frac{1}{2}\kappa\delta\oint\left(\frac{1}{8\pi G} + 4\lambda R\right)\hat{\epsilon}_{ab}\epsilon^{ab} \\ &= \kappa\delta\left(\frac{A}{8\pi G} + 4\lambda\oint R\hat{\epsilon}_{ab}\epsilon^{ab}\right) \end{aligned} \tag{A.7}$$

where we used the fact that $\oint \hat{\epsilon}_{ab}\epsilon^{ab} = -2A$ where A is the area of the black hole. Thus using $\kappa = 2\pi T$ we find

$$\delta\int \langle T_{ab}\rangle \chi^a\epsilon^b = T\delta\left(\frac{A}{4G} - 2\pi\cdot 2\lambda\oint R\hat{\epsilon}_{ab}\epsilon^{ab}\right), \tag{A.8}$$

and from the expression for the statistical entropy variation from eq. (12) we find that

$$\begin{aligned} \delta S_{st} &= \beta\delta\int \langle T_{ab}\rangle \chi^a\epsilon^b \\ &= \delta\left(A/4G - 2\pi\cdot 2\lambda\oint R\hat{\epsilon}_{ab}\epsilon^{ab}\right) \end{aligned} \tag{A.9}$$

Since for the theory in eq. (A.1) Wald entropy $S_W = -2\pi\oint_H \frac{\partial\mathscr{L}}{\partial R_{abcd}}\hat{\epsilon}_{ab}\varepsilon_{cd}$ becomes $S_W = A/4G - 2\pi\cdot 2\lambda\oint R\hat{\epsilon}_{ab}\epsilon^{ab}$, we find that

$$\delta S_{st} = \delta S_W. \tag{A.10}$$

[1] R. M. Wald, “Black hole entropy is the Noether charge,” Phys. Rev. D **48**, 3427 (1993)

[2] V. Iyer and R. M. Wald, “Some properties of Noether charge and a proposal for dynamical black hole entropy,” Phys.

Rev. D **50**, 846 (1994)

[3] G. ’t Hooft,“ The Quantum Structure of a Black Hole,” Nucl. Phys. B**256**, 727 (1985).

[4] L. Susskind and J. Uglum, “Black hole entropy in canonical quantum gravity and superstring theory,” Phys. Rev. D **50**, 2700 (1994)

[5] R. Brustein and M. Hadad, “The Einstein equations for generalized theories of gravity and the thermodynamic relation $\delta Q = T\delta S$ are equivalent,” Phys. Rev. Lett. 103, 101301 (2009)

[6] I. P. Neupane, “Effective Lagrangian from higher curvature terms: Absence of vDVZ discontinuity in AdS space,” Class. Quant. Grav. **19**, 1167 (2002)

[7] In[5] the calculations were for energy per unit temperature. Conversion back to the units used in [2] gives eq.(13).